

1  
2  
3  
4

**Standing Document**  
**Normative Referencing**

5 **Contents**

	1 Purpose and scope of this Guide .....	1
	2 JTC 1 approach to referencing other specifications .....	2
	3 Terms for normative references to other specifications .....	3
	4 Principles for referencing of specifications .....	3
10	4.1 Scope .....	3
	4.2 Conformity Interoperability .....	3
	4.3 Ballot of referencing specification .....	3
	4.4 Required Elements .....	3
	4.5 Material to be submitted for the ballot.....	4
15	4.6 Referencing Rules .....	4
	4.7 Nested Referencing.....	4
	5 Description of the process for JTC 1 Subcommittee use .....	4
	5.1 Announcement of intent to make reference .....	4
	5.2 Preparation of the Referencing Explanatory Report .....	4
20	5.3 Availability of the Referencing Explanatory Report .....	5
	5.4 Ballot .....	5
	5.5 Publication of the standard .....	5
	5.6 Maintenance .....	5
	5.7 Documentation requirements .....	5
25	6 Evaluation of a proposed RS .....	6
	6.1 Introduction .....	6
	6.2 Supplementary elements .....	6
	6.3 Criteria .....	6
	6.3.1 Co-operative stance .....	6
30	7 An Approved RS Originator (ARO) .....	7
	7.1 Confirmation as an Approved RS Originator (ARO) .....	7
	7.2 Change of status for an Approved RS Originator .....	8
33		

34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49  
50  
51  
52  
53  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60  
61  
62  
63  
64  
65  
66  
67  
68  
69  
70  
71  
72  
73  
74  
75  
76  
77  
78  
79  
80  
81  
82  
83  
84  
85  
86  
87  
88  
89  
90  
91

In addition to ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2, 6.2.2 and the JTC 1 Supplement the following clauses apply:

## 1 Purpose and scope of this Guide

ISO/IEC JTC 1 has defined and implemented a policy that encourages and assists the transposition of certain technical specifications from sources outside ISO, IEC or ITU into international standards. Such specifications can be transposed into International Standards developed via the ISO/IEC Fast Track Procedure (see ISO/IEC Directives Part 1, [Annex F.2](#) and JTC 1 Supplement Annex F.2) or via the JTC 1 PAS Transposition Process (see JTC 1 Supplement, [Annex F.3](#)).

As no restrictions apply to making informative references (see ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2, 6.2.2), the scope of this document is limited to the normative referencing of a specification other than from ISO, IEC or ITU in an International Standard.

JTC 1 also recognizes that there may be situations where it is appropriate to reference an external specification without transforming it into an International Standard. This situation may apply in a number of cases.

This document covers the case when an International Standard (IS) is developed by a JTC 1 Subcommittee, as well as when International Standards are a result of adoption via the ISO/IEC Fast-Track Procedure or the JTC 1 PAS Transposition Process. It describes the process requirements for all three cases, to be fulfilled by the JTC 1 SC, or the Fast-Track/PAS submitter (all being called hereafter the Submitter), which is proposing the standard containing normative references. Should requirements differ between SC and Fast-Track or PAS Submitters, this is indicated below.

JTC 1 re-emphasises its preference for transposition into International Standards as the approach to include material from outside ISO, IEC or ITU. However, if the referencing approach is chosen, it is necessary to establish such references in international standards in a consistent way which ensures the quality of international standards established by JTC 1 as well as the proper treatment of IPR issues. This document defines a process for the inclusion of normative references to specifications other than those created by ISO, IEC or ITU.

JTC 1 SCs may, in the course of their work, find it appropriate to incorporate specifications into an emerging IS by way of reference. The need for such action, the selection of the appropriate specification, and the evaluation of the proposed Referenced Specification (RS) itself are matters for the SC to determine. Any such SC decision will, however, be subject to JTC 1 National Body evaluation during the respective ballot.

JTC 1 SCs are reminded that, in accordance to Resolution 28 of the 11th JTC 1 Plenary Meeting, in Seoul, Korea, in 1999, "SCs and National Bodies are requested to pay particular attention to mechanisms that could be utilized to reduce the burden of the process on officers at the SC level. Examples can include reuse by one SC of a prior written statements developed by another SC, or the use of appropriate statements from approved co-operative agreements between JTC 1 and another organization."

These Guidelines provide insights to facilitate the SC consideration and subsequent incorporation of an RS into a JTC 1 IS. Since the consideration of a proposed RS may well involve more than purely technical considerations, it is deemed helpful to provide these Guidelines. The SC is asked to use this document to facilitate the process. As to IPR issues or organisational matters, it is expected that the SC will contact the appropriate bodies (e.g. ITTF) to obtain the necessary information and that the SC will, if necessary, facilitate discussion between ISO/IEC and the RS Originator.

## 92 **2 JTC 1 approach to referencing other specifications**

93 According to ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2, referencing sources other than ISO, IEC, or ITU is a  
94 valid approach for making use of such specifications, provided that the provisions listed in  
95 6.2.2 of the ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2 are fulfilled.

96  
97

98 JTC 1 supports this approach, it has to maintain the quality of its work and the integrity of the  
99 standards development process. Therefore, it is necessary to establish some referencing  
100 rules that complement those of ISO/IEC. Though rules and guidelines are important, JTC 1  
101 wishes them to be as straightforward as possible. This also takes account of the fact that the  
102 initiative for establishing references usually comes from the standards developing community  
103 within JTC 1. Further, minimal additional burden should be put on the originator of a  
104 specification being referenced.

105

## 106 **3 Terms for normative references to other specifications**

107

108 The process of establishing normative references to documents other than from ISO, IEC or  
109 ITU is based on the ISO/IEC Directives, Part 1 and the JTC 1 Supplement with the addition of  
110 the following terms:

- 111 • The Submitter: The JTC 1 SC, Fast-Track or PAS Submitter developing the standard  
112 including such normative references.
- 113
- 114 • Referenced Specification (RS): A specification from a source other than ISO, IEC, or ITU is  
115 called a Referenced Specification (RS) if it meets certain criteria (see clause 6) and has  
116 been balloted and accepted together with the FDIS at the JTC 1 National Body level as  
117 suitable for normative referencing in the resulting international standard (IS). An RS may be  
118 a part of a larger specification.
- 119
- 120 • Referencing Explanatory Report (RER): document explaining how the JTC 1 criteria are  
121 met.
- 122
- 123 • RS Originator: The organization that developed and maintains the RS.
- 124
- 125 • Approved RS Originator (ARO): An organization that has been approved as an RS  
126 originator for all of its standards (see clause 7).

## 127 **4 Principles for referencing of specifications**

### 128 **4.1 Scope**

129 An RS shall be within the JTC 1 scope.

### 130 **4.2 Conformity and Interoperability**

131 All ISs containing normative references to other specifications have to follow the same  
132 requirements and rules concerning conformity and interoperability, as for other JTC 1  
133 standards as defined in the ISO/IEC Directives, Part 1 and the JTC 1 Standing Documents on  
134 Conformity and Interoperability.

### 135 **4.3 Ballot of referencing specification**

136 When the referencing specification (CD, DIS or FDIS) is submitted for ballot it shall either be  
137 accompanied by a Referencing Explanatory Report (RER) which has been generated by the  
138 Submitter wishing to reference the RS in a target IS or the Submitter will ensure that the  
139 organization creating the reference specification has previously met such organizational  
140 requirements so as to be listed as an Approved RS Originator (ARO).

141

### 142 **4.4 RER Required Elements**

143 The RER shall contain the following elements:

- 144  
145 a) justification for the referencing which shall also address the following aspects:  
146     1 relationship of the proposed RS to existing or emerging international  
147         standards (and regional or other standards as appropriate) and when the RS  
148         is competing with or complementing an existing or emerging international  
149         standard, the rationale for the referencing;  
150     2 the degree of market acceptance of the proposed RS; and  
151     3 the rationale as to why the transposition of the proposed RS into an IS is  
152         inappropriate or impractical,  
153  
154 b) statements that address the criteria as detailed in clause 6.  
155  
156 c) a copy of the normative referencing policy of the RS Originator (where one exists).  
157

#### 158 **4.5 Material to be submitted for the ballot**

159 The material submitted for ballot shall either include a copy of the proposed RS or a means  
160 by which National Bodies may readily access the material (e.g., ISBN or URL) and meet the  
161 availability requirements as specified in 6.3. If the referenced material has been made  
162 available to JTC 1 member bodies previously as an N numbered document, it is acceptable,  
163 instead, to refer to that document.

#### 164 **4.6 Referencing Rules**

165 For actual referencing, the rules of the ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2, apply. In contrast to the  
166 ISO/IEC rules, any reference shall be specific and indicate the publication date and/or version  
167 number as appropriate.

#### 168 **4.7 Nested Referencing**

169 If an RS, in turn, contains a normative reference to a specification other than an international  
170 standard or ARO standard, the information required by an RER shall normally be provided for  
171 each additional reference. The exception to this requirement is when the level of detail  
172 involved would be so time-consuming to assemble, and difficult to interpret, that its collection  
173 would be counterproductive. In this case, the Submitter shall explain the situation in a way  
174 that will enable National Bodies to make an informed assessment of the references that are  
175 being made. The Submitter is expected to thoroughly process all nested references.  
176

### 177 **5 Process Description**

#### 178 **5.1 Announcement of intent to make reference**

179  
180 The intention to make a normative reference to a specification other than an international  
181 standard should be stated in the New Work Item Proposal (NP) if the requirement is known at  
182 that time; otherwise, the intent should be communicated to JTC 1 National Bodies as soon as  
183 consensus on the need is reached in the SC. Fast-Track or PAS Submitters need to state this  
184 situation in the Explanatory Report accompanying their submission.

#### 185 **5.2 Preparation of the Referencing Explanatory Report**

186  
187 It is the obligation of the Submitter which develops a proposed IS containing normative  
188 references to specifications other than international standards, to either provide for each  
189 proposed RS a related RER or to ensure that the organization is an ARO. The elements of  
190 this Report are described in 4.4 above. In order to avoid any undue delay in the standard  
191 ratification process and to avoid the wasting of development resources, the production of a  
192 RER or the confirmation of the organization as an ARO should commence as soon as the  
193 standard developing Subcommittee has determined the need to establish a normative  
194 reference.

### 195 **5.3 Availability of the Referencing Explanatory Report**

196

197 The RER, or confirmation of the organization as an ARO, shall be made available to JTC 1  
198 and its National Bodies as early as possible and appropriate. The latest date for the  
199 availability of the Report or ARO status is the submission of the first CD ballot; or the DIS  
200 ballot for Fast-Track/PAS submissions. A reference to the RER/ARO confirmation shall also  
201 accompany any subsequent CD, DIS and FDIS ballot.

202

### 203 **5.4 Ballot**

204

205 The material submitted for ballot (CD, DIS and FDIS) shall include the RER/ARO confirmation  
206 together with a copy of the proposed RS or a means by which National Bodies may readily  
207 access the material (e.g., ISBN or URL). If the Report or the proposed RS were provided  
208 earlier, it is acceptable to give, instead, a reference to the earlier submission and a statement  
209 verifying that no changes have occurred in the meantime.

210

211 In the case of a CD ballot, JTC 1 National Bodies are invited to independently submit their  
212 comments on the RER/ARO confirmation by the time the CD ballot closes, for review by the  
213 relevant SC.

214

215 Comments and votes are handled in the usual way. The RS Originator may be invited to  
216 attend the appropriate part of any meeting held to resolve ballot comments.

217

### 218 **5.5 Publication of the standard**

219

220 No particular provisions regarding publication apply where an IS contains a reference to an  
221 RS. The source of the RS may be different from that of an IS, and it is not required that the  
222 text of the RS should be published, or distributed, with the referencing standard.

223

### 224 **5.6 Maintenance**

225

226 It is expected that JTC 1 will evaluate the consequences of any change to the RS subsequent  
227 to its inclusion as a reference in a JTC 1 standard, for appropriate action (e.g. revision,  
228 exclusion). At every maintenance interval the RER and all RSs shall be evaluated for their  
229 continued availability and relevance. If required (see clause 3), new RERs may be generated  
230 for RSs not presently covered by an RER or sourced from an ARO.

231

### 232 **5.7 Documentation requirements**

233

234 Further to the requirements in the ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2, all RSs to which a normative  
235 reference is made should be identified in a subclause of clause 2 of the IS. This subclause  
236 should start with the following text:

237

238 "All references in this subclause were correct at the time of approval of this International  
239 Standard. The provisions of the referenced specifications, as identified in this subclause, are  
240 valid within the context of this IS. The reference to a specification within this IS does not give  
241 it any further status within ISO/IEC; in particular, it does not give the referenced specification  
242 the status of an International Standard."

243

## 244 **6 Evaluation of a proposed RS**

### 245 **6.1 Introduction**

246

247 JTC 1 has established criteria (see 6.3) which serve as a basis for the judgment as to whether  
 248 a particular specification can be accepted as a normative reference in an international  
 249 standard. This judgment initially occurs at JTC 1 Subcommittee level when a decision to  
 250 establish a normative reference is made, and later at NB level during the CD, DIS or FDIS  
 251 ballot.

252  
 253 Similarly for specifications submitted via the ISO/IEC Fast-Track Procedure or the JTC 1 PAS  
 254 Transposition Process, the judgment will occur at NB level during the DIS or FDIS ballot. The  
 255 Fast-Track or PAS Submitter should thus be aware of and exercise these criteria when  
 256 incorporating normative references in its submission.

257  
 258 JTC 1 considers that the primary benefit of these criteria is guidance for consistent evaluation  
 259 rather than an absolute pass/fail mechanism. There is a wide variety of specifications  
 260 available for consideration as well as a wide variety of needs within the JTC 1 community. An  
 261 absolute pass/fail mechanism over such a wide variety of material is unlikely. What is needed  
 262 throughout this process is flexibility and good judgment on the part of all concerned. Rather  
 263 than provide quantitative measures to evaluate acceptability of a proposed RS on a pass/ fail  
 264 basis, the criteria set forth the key topics for consideration and measures for evaluating them  
 265 in terms of the scope, depth, and thoroughness with which the criteria topics have been  
 266 considered.

267

## 268 **6.2 Supplementary elements**

269

270 It is intended that the questions asked under each Criteria Category are to be viewed as  
 271 examples of ways in which the basic criteria sub-category might be evaluated. There may well  
 272 be other responses to unasked questions that best describe how well a given proposed RS  
 273 meets, for example, an acceptable level of "Quality". In general, the more complete the RER  
 274 and its accompanying documents, the easier it will be for JTC 1 National Bodies to evaluate  
 275 an international standard making a normative reference to an RS.

276

277

## 278 **6.3 Criteria**

279

280 The Submitter shall notify the RS Originator of the intent to reference the RS and provide the  
 281 RS Originator with a copy of the RER. The Submitter is encouraged to, where possible, work  
 282 with the RS Originator to ensure the accuracy of all elements of the RER. The RS Originator  
 283 shall be provided the opportunity, within a reasonable period of time, to object to the  
 284 reference to the RS. If the RS Originator notifies the Submitter that it objects to such a  
 285 reference the Submitter shall not include the reference to the RS.

286

287 The RER shall contain comprehensive statements covering the following categories and  
 288 topics:

289

290 • Ongoing maintenance:  
 291 If the RS Originator is not available to maintain the RS, who is responsible for maintenance  
 292 of the RS if and when the need arises?

293

294 • Changes  
 295 What is the flexibility of the RS Originator to apply changes to the RS if so requested during  
 296 the process of balloting the draft international standard (CD, DIS or FDIS) which makes  
 297 reference to the RS?

298

299 • Availability of the referenced specification  
 300 What is the status of public availability of the RS on fair, reasonable and nondiscriminatory  
 301 terms and conditions? Standards that are Publicly Available to implementers, evaluators

- 302 and other interested parties for as long as the IS that references them is an active  
 303 document are those which:
- 304     ▪ May be obtained from the source organization by any person (with or without  
 305 payment) simply by quoting the reference given in the IS to the source  
 306 organization or typical supplier.
  - 307     ▪ Are available in one of the official ISO or IEC languages from a publicly  
 308 accessible source.
  - 309     ▪ Are available without contractual limitations relating to their evaluation (other than  
 310 limitations reasonably intended to restrict duplication and redistribution) and  
 311 without substantive contractual limits on implementation of the referenced  
 312 material or the IS as a condition of obtaining access to the referenced material.  
 313
- 314 • Intellectual property rights
  - 315 It is the Submitter's responsibility to ensure that statements in response related to 'Patents'
  - 316 and 'Copyrights' are provided in the RER. The Submitter is encouraged to work with the RS
  - 317 Originator to ensure the accuracy of the statements on the items listed below.
  - 318     ▪ Patents:  
 319 What is the status of the RS Originator, or where appropriate, the policy  
 320 governing the RS meeting the Common Patent Policy for ITU-T/ITU-R/ISO/IEC  
 321 (see the ISO/IEC Directives, Part 1, Annex L) on patent matters ?
  - 322     ▪ Copyrights:  
 323 What copyrights exist, and what copyright licences are the RS Originator willing  
 324 to grant, throughout both the evaluation and the publication cycle?
  - 325     ▪ Trademark rights:  
 326 What trademarks apply to the RS and with what conditions?
  - 327 • Quality
  - 328 The Submitter shall establish that the proposed RS is of adequate quality, considering
  - 329 topics such as the length of the time the specification has existed, whether products have
  - 330 been implemented using it, whether conformance requirements are clear, and whether the
  - 331 specification is readily and widely available.
  - 332

## 333 7 An Approved RS Originator (ARO)

### 334 7.1 Confirmation as an Approved RS Originator (ARO)

335  
 336 On the occasion that a particular RS Originator has already been referenced by a prior  
 337 ISO/IEC JTC 1 IS (TR or TS) and documented in an RER or in preparation for future  
 338 referencing in an IS (TR or TS), JTC 1, an SC, or any National Body may nominate the RS  
 339 Originator to be confirmed as an ARO. In the absence of an objection from the candidate  
 340 ARO, an ARO Overview Submission, describing the RS Originator's cooperative stance: the  
 341 ongoing maintenance agreement, the application of changes, the availability of the referenced  
 342 specifications, the position of the RS Originator on intellectual property, patent rights,  
 343 copyrights, and trademark rights, and the overall qualification of all of its deliverables to meet  
 344 the criteria specified herein for RSs, shall be issued for a 3 month ballot by JTC 1 for approval  
 345 of that organization as an ARO. Upon ballot approval, the RS Originator shall be added to a  
 346 list of AROs in good standing. Such a list of Approved RS Originators will be maintained by  
 347 the JTC 1 Secretariat and is published on the JTC 1 website.

348  
 349 A Submitter may reference an ARO as a previously submitted and Approved RS Originator..  
 350

### 351 7.2 Change of status for an Approved RS Originator

352  
 353 An SC, or National Body or a Fast-Track/PAS Submitter shall notify JTC 1 if it becomes  
 354 aware that the content of an ARO's Overview Submission is no longer accurate. Furthermore,  
 355 prior to referencing an ARO in an FDIS or amended IS, the Submitter must confirm that all  
 356 content as contained in the documented ARO's Overview Submission is accurate and current.  
 357

358 Should an ARO's procedures vary in a non-essential manner from the ARO Overview  
359 Submission on file, the Submitter, in cooperation with the ARO, shall provide an updated ARO  
360 Overview, no later than submission of the FDIS/FDAM ballot to JTC 1. The JTC 1 Secretariat  
361 shall notify all other affected Submitters of a change in the ARO's RER for their consideration.  
362 Should an ARO's policies change in a substantial manner (e.g., such that they are no longer  
363 aligned with ISO/IEC Directives and Policies), the submitting SC or NB shall request  
364 reconfirmation with JTC 1 of the organization's status as an ARO. Should reconfirmation fail,  
365 the ARO shall be removed from the JTC 1 ARO listing and the affected Submitters shall be  
366 notified to take necessary action to address all pending referenced specifications from that  
367 ARO.  
368  
369