

# Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2009-11-04	Document : ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 34 N 1248
------------------	---------------------------------------

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB <sup>1</sup>	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com- ment <sup>2</sup>	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
BR	2		te	Removal of an explicit version of Unicode is a significant change for applications and will affect compliance	Move the proposal to an Amendment, because the proposed change could break compatibility with existing implementations	<b>BR-0001</b>
BR	3		te	Explicitly changing the version of XML is a significant change for applications and will affect compliance	Move the proposal to an Amendment, because the proposed change could break compatibility with existing implementations	<b>BR-0002</b>
BR	4		te	Changing namespaces is a significant change for applications and will affect compliance	Move the proposal to an Amendment, because the proposed change could break compatibility with existing implementations	<b>BR-0003</b>
CA	2		ed	This changes the cited ISO/IEC 10646:2003 edition to an undated, floating, reference.	Canada encourages an editorial change to this reference to clarify exactly what an "undated reference" means. For example, the W3C XQuery 1.0 Recommendation's normative reference to ISO/IEC 10646 states: ISO (International Organization for Standardization). ISO/IEC 10646:2003. Information technology—Universal Multiple-Octet Coded Character Set (UCS), as, from time to time, amended, replaced by a new edition, or expanded by the addition of new parts. [Geneva]: International Organization for Standardization. (See <a href="http://www.iso.org">http://www.iso.org</a> for the latest version.)  Using the above kind of normative	<b>CA-0001</b>

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by \*\*)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

**NOTE** Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

# Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2009-11-04	Document : ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 34 N 1248
------------------	---------------------------------------

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB <sup>1</sup>	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com- ment <sup>2</sup>	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
					reference would make it very clear to implementers what an "undated reference" means.	
FR	169		ed	<p>Instead of</p> <p>"XML, Tim Bray, Jean Paoli, Eve Maler, C. M. Sperberg-McQueen, Eve Maler, and François Yergeau (editors). Extensible Markup Language (XML) 1.0, Fourth Edition.1 World Wide Web Consortium. 2006. <a href="http://www.w3.org/TR/2006/REC-xml-20060816/">http://www.w3.org/TR/2006/REC-xml-20060816/</a>"</p> <p>Should be</p> <p>"XML, Tim Bray, Jean Paoli, Eve Maler, C. M. Sperberg-McQueen and François Yergeau (editors). Extensible Markup Language (XML) 1.0, Fourth Edition.1 World Wide Web Consortium. 2006. <a href="http://www.w3.org/TR/2006/REC-xml-20060816/">http://www.w3.org/TR/2006/REC-xml-20060816/</a>"</p> <p>(remove the repeated name of Eve Maler)</p>		<b>FR-0001</b>
FR	170		ed	<p>Instead of</p> <p>"XML Namespaces, Bray, Tim, Dave Hollander, Andrew Layman, and Richard Tobin</p>		<b>FR-0002</b>

<sup>1</sup> **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by \*\*)

<sup>2</sup> **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

**NOTE** Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

# Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2009-11-04	Document : ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 34 N 1248
------------------	---------------------------------------

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB <sup>1</sup>	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com- ment <sup>2</sup>	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
				<p>(editors). Namespaces in XML 1.0. World Wide Web Consortium. 2006"</p> <p>Should be</p> <p>"XML Namespaces, Tim Bray, Dave Hollander, Andrew Layman, and Richard Tobin (editors). Namespaces in XML 1.0, Second Edition. World Wide Web Consortium. 2006"</p> <p>(Tim Bray is only one person and this is the second edition)</p>		
GB	2		te	<p>An undated reference to an RS is prohibited by the JTC 1 Directives Annex N which states: "any reference shall be specific and indicate the publication date and/or version number as appropriate".</p>	Omit this correction.	<b>GB-0001</b>
GB	3		ed	<p>The footnote appears to say nothing of value, since any normative reference to a Reference Specification that has a date and/or edition number may need to be revised when the Reference Specification is revised. It's inclusion in the standard is therefore unnecessary and open to misinterpretation.</p>	<p>Replace the footnote text with the following text, or similar:</p> <p>Implementers should be aware that a further correction of the normative reference to XML to refer to the current Edition will be necessary when the related Reference Specifications to which this International Standard also makes normative reference and which also depend upon XML, such as XSLT, XML Namespaces and XML Base, are all aligned with the latest Edition</p>	<b>GB-0002</b>

<sup>1</sup> **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by \*\*)

<sup>2</sup> **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

**NOTE** Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

**Template for comments and secretariat observations**

Date: 2009-11-04	Document : ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 34 N 1248
------------------	---------------------------------------

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB <sup>1</sup>	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com- ment <sup>2</sup>	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted

|

1   **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by \*\*)

2   **Type of comment:**   **ge** = general       **te** = technical       **ed** = editorial

**NOTE**       Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.